7a. Do 4 Step Refutation (Beginning Policy)

Tell them about 4 step refutation. Then, make everyone in the group get up and do it. Offer comments after each speaker on how they could use better word economy, have better responses, etc. A good idea is to do stop and go until they get it right.

CLASHING

ACTIVITY: Play the "I disagree game". Have students split into two groups, go to sides of the room, line up single file and face each other. Start by having the first student in one of the two lines (line A) make an argument. On the other side (line B), the first student should say, "I disagree because . . .", and should complete the sentence. The second person in line A should make an argument and the second person in the line B should respond with, "I disagree because . . ." and the process continues until everyone has made an argument. Then, reverse roles and have line B make arguments and line A make responses.

I. HOW TO CLASH

A. FLOW OPPONENT ARGUMENT
   Listen to it carefully

B. PREPARE RESPONSES

WORKING EXAMPLE: Show students example arguments on the overhead.

1. AGREE WITH THE ARGUMENT--IT IS IRRELEVANT OR HELPS YOUR CASE
2. POINT OUT THAT THE ARGUMENT HAS LITTLE IMPORTANCE
3. DISAGREE WITH THE ARGUMENT
   --TO REFUTE, YOU EXPOSE FLAWS IN YOUR OPPONENT'S ARGUMENTS.

WORKING EXAMPLE: Refute one of the overhead arguments. Have students refute the other arguments.

--TO COUNTERARGUE, YOU PRESENT A DOCUMENTED POINT THAT IS THE OPPOSITE OF YOUR OPPONENT'S ARGUMENT

WORKING EXAMPLE: Present a counterargument against one of the overhead arguments.

NOTE THAT REFUTATION AND COUNTERARGUMENTATION SHOULD GO HAND IN HAND.
The flaw you expose in your opponent's argument should not be a flaw in your argument.

EXAMPLE: If you argue that their evidence is outdated, your evidence should have up-to-date evidence.

WORKING EXAMPLE: Point out how your counterargument does not suffer from the same flaw you pointed out in your refutation argument.

ACTIVITY: Give students eight minutes to prepare counterarguments against the other arguments on the overhead projector. Tell them that they can makeup evidence for this one activity.

ACTIVITY: Present three arguments with obvious flaws on the overhead that you know students have briefs or cards against. Give them ten minutes to prepare a refutation and counterargument against each of the arguments using their briefs or cards. Choose students to present responses. Comment on their responses. Are they refuting and counterarguing? Is their refutation and counterargument persuasive? Does their counterargument suffer from the same flaw they claim exists in the overhead argument?

C. THE 4 STEP PROCESS

WORKING EXAMPLE: Present overhead transparency affirmative case flowsheet of arguments. Use the first argument to offer examples of each of the four steps.